

<http://www.dailypioneer.com/201194/Ishrat-encounter-was-not-fake-Modi-Govt.html>

## **Ishrat encounter was not fake: Modi Govt**

### **Pioneer news service | Ahmedabad/New Delhi**

The Gujarat Government on Tuesday dismissed Justice Tamang panel report in the Ishrat Jahan killing and said it was not a fake encounter.

Addressing a press conference, state government spokesperson Jay Narayan Vyas said, "Justice Tamang report is invalid and the Gujarat government will challenge it," adding that the "encounter was not fake."

Vyas said Magistrate Tamang prepared the report in a "hurry", without giving Gujarat government a chance to express its views. He said the panel did not give chance to either the Gujarat government to place its side nor did it allow the accused police officers to defend themselves.

Vyas also dragged the Centre into the whole controversy by pointing out that the Centre had declared Ishrat and her associate Javed as LeT operatives with links with a Pakistani national Muzzamil in Pakistan.

The Tamang panel on Monday said the 2004 killing of young college girl Ishrat Jahan and three others suspected to be on a mission to "kill" Chief Minister Narendra Modi was a case of "fake encounter" stage managed by the by the police, which killed them in cold blood.

The report said Ishrat, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were killed in a fake encounter on the outskirts of the city on June 15, 2004 and they were not linked with Pakistan-based terror outfit Lashker-e-Toiba, as claimed by the police.

Meanwhile, in Delhi while the BJP has defended the Narendra Modi, the Congress and CPI(M) have slammed the Gujarat government over the fake encounter allegations.

Senior BJP leader Venkaiah Naidu has said Gujarat Chief Minister cannot be held responsible for everything that happens in the state.

But holding Modi squarely responsible for the Ishrat's killing, Law Minister M Veerappa Moily said Modi would have been in "some other place" if the Ishrat Jahan fake encounter had taken place in a foreign country.

He told reporters that Modi could be headed for bigger trouble as "there are

many such cases which are coming up now. If more investigations are conducted, more skeletons may tumble".

Noting that the law will take its own course, he said the revelations in the Ishrat Jahan encounter was a "very serious matter for the country and....Any other foreign country, Narendra Modi would have been in some other place".

Terming the incident as "most unfortunate", Moily said "many things are done brutally and inhuman things are being done".

The CPI(M) has demanded resignation of Modi and said he should take moral responsibility for the killing of a college girl and three others in a fake encounter five years ago.

"The targeted killings of persons belonging to the minority community by the state police reveals the state of affairs under the Narendra Modi government," the CPI(M) Politburo said in a statement.

"The enquiry has revealed the hand of senior police officials including the then Ahmedabad Police Commissioner and DIG Vanzara who is now facing trial for another fake encounter killing -- of Soharabuddin Sheikh and his wife," the statement said.

The Politburo demanded immediate action to arrest and prosecute all the police personnel involved in these murders.

"Exemplary punishment has to be meted out in this case as the crime has been committed by those entrusted with upholding the law. Given the spate of illegal encounter killings which took place under the encouragement of the state government, Modi should take moral responsibility and quit office," the statement added.

<http://news.rediff.com/report/2009/sep/08/cpim-for-modi-ouster-over-ishrat-jahan-fake-encounter.htm>

## **Ishrat Jahan case: CPM for Modi's ouster**

The Communist Party of India-Marxist demanded the resignation of Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi [ [Images](#) ], on Tuesday, asking him to take moral responsibility for the killing of a college girl and three others in a fake encounter five years ago.

"The targeted killings of persons belonging to the minority community by the state police reveals the state of affairs under the Narendra Modi government," the CPI-M [ [Images](#) ] Politbureau said in a statement.

The encounter in which college girl Ishrat Jahan and three others were gunned down in 2004 was fake and executed in cold blood by police officers after the four were suspected to be on a mission to 'kill' Chief Minister Narendra Modi, the judicial probe had found. "The enquiry has revealed the hand of senior police officials including the then Ahmedabad [ [Images](#) ] Police Commissioner and current Deputy Inspector General of Police DG Vanzara who is now facing trial for another fake encounter killing -- of Soharabuddin Sheikh and his wife," the statement said.

The Politbureau demanded immediate action to arrest and prosecute all the police personnel involved in these murders. "Exemplary punishment has to be meted out in this case as the crime has been committed by those entrusted with upholding the law. Given the spate of illegal encounter killings which took place under the encouragement of the state government, Modi should take moral responsibility and quit office," the statement added.

<http://news.rediff.com/report/2009/sep/08/bjp-defends-modi-in-ishrat-jahan-case.htm>

## **BJP defends Modi in Ishrat Jahan case**

The Bharatiya Janata Party [ [Images](#) ] on Tuesday defended Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi [ [Images](#) ] in the Ishrat Jahan encounter controversy, saying he cannot be held responsible for everything that happens in the state.

"Why should Modi take a call?...Do you think anything that happens in any state, the chief minister is responsible? If anything happens in the national capital, is the Prime Minister responsible?" senior BJP leader M Venkaiah Naidu said in reply to a question on whether Modi should be held accountable for the Ishrat Jahan encounter.

Naidu accused the media of suffering from "Modi-mania."

"How is the chief minister concerned with this (Ishrat Jahan case)? Let law take its own course," he said.

The S P Tamang report had on Monday alleged that Ishrat Jahan and three others were killed by police in a fake encounter in 2004, terming them as terrorists. The Gujarat government rejected the report on Tuesday.

Naidu said the approach should be "going case by case" whenever such allegations of encounters or human rights violations come up.

<http://news.rediff.com/report/2009/sep/08/gujarat-to-challenge-clean-chit-to-ishrat-jahan.htm>

## **Gujarat government to challenge clean chit to Ishrat Jahan**

The Gujarat government on Tuesday rejected the S P Tamang report which concluded that Ishrat Jahan and three others were killed in a fake encounter in 2004 and said it would challenge it in a higher court.

"Magistrate Tamang's report is bad in law, and he has overstepped his jurisdiction by submitting his report even before a high-level committee appointed by the high court to probe the matter could do so," Gujarat government spokesman Jaynarayan Vyas said.

"The report prepared by the magistrate is beyond the jurisdiction of section 176 CrPC (inquiry by magistrate in to cause of death) and will not stand legal scrutiny," Vyas claimed at a press conference in Ahmedabad [ [Images](#) ].

Quoting the Union government's affidavit in the Supreme Court, he said it clearly stated that Ishrat and the other three were Lashkar-e-Tayiba [ [Images](#) ] operatives and were planning terror strikes in Gujarat.

Magistrate Tamang's report, submitted on Monday, said the encounter in which 19-year-old college student Ishrat Jahan and three others were gunned down in 2004 was fake and executed in "cold blood" by police officers for selfish motives.

They were allegedly plotting to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi [ [Images](#) ]. The report of the investigation conducted by the magistrate had accused senior police officers of "staging" the encounter.

<http://epaper.mailtoday.in/epaperhome.aspx?issue=892009>

#### **Probe says Gujarat encounter was fake**

By Mail Today Bureau in Ahmedabad

THE GUJARAT Police had staged a fake encounter to kill teenager Ishrat Jahan and three innocent youngsters in 2004, a judicial probe revealed on Monday.

Top police officers connived among themselves and executed the murders in cold blood for selfish motives. The four were later falsely branded as militants of a Pakistani outfit on a mission to kill chief minister Narendra Modi.

Metropolitan judge S. P. Tamang's report disclosed that the so-called "encounter" staged by the Ahmedabad Crime Branch in June 2004 was similar in tenor to the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case. D. G. Vanzara, the then DIG found to be involved in both the cases, was subsequently suspended and imprisoned.

In his 243-page handwritten report, Tamang maintained that the four victims were kidnapped by the Ahmedabad Crime Branch from Mumbai on June 12, 2004 and brought to Ahmedabad. They were killed by the sleuths of the Crime Branch for their personal interests and to gain promotions and appreciation from the chief minister.

Chief metropolitan magistrate D. M. Patel handed over the case for investigation to Tamang on August 13, 2009 after the Gujarat High Court had directed the state police to form a high-level team of enquiry to reinvestigate the encounter.

This followed after Shamima Kausar, Ishrat's mother, filed a petition alleging foul-play in her daughter's murder. A similar plea was filed by Gopinath Pillai, father of Pranesh Pillai alias Javed, who was also killed in the encounter.

The state police also formed a three- member team comprising ADGP Pramod Kumar, IG Mohan Jha and DIG J. K. Bhatt.

The team is expected to submit its report before November 30.

Tamang's damning report goes on to implicate the top rung of the Ahmedabad Police, including the then Ahmedabad commissioner K. R. Kaushik, JCP Crime Branch P. P. Pandey, Vanzara, DCP Crime Branch N. K. Amin and many other officials of the rank of an inspector and below.

Tamang revealed that Ishrat's autopsy report indicated that her rigor mortis had started between 11 pm to 12 am of June 14, indicating that she was killed before June 15, 2004 and the policemen fired at her body from their service revolvers while staging the encounter. Similarly, all the other victims — Javed, Amjad Ali and Jishan Johar Abdul Gani — were actually dead by the time the fake encounter was staged.

The judge also noted that Ishrat was the sole bread earner for her family and worked as a sales girl in Javed's shop in Mumbai. " She was also a good student and a good citizen of India," Tamang added.

Lawyer- activist Dr. Mukul Sinha, appearing for Gopinath Pillai, said " the report brings out the terrible things happening in Gujarat between 2002 and 2005". The report will now be placed before the special investigation team as well as the court hearing the writ filed by Pillai.

THOUGH THE Gujarat minister of state for home affairs or director general of police S. S. Khandvawala could not be contacted for their reactions, the Opposition Congress lost no time in coming down heavily on chief minister Narendra Modi. " It's clearly a case of state- sponsored terrorism unleashed by Modi," Gujarat Congress spokesperson Arjun Modvadia said.

He added that the motive behind these murders was to garner public sympathy and terrorise the common man. " This is a very serious matter and we are working out our next plan of action.

We will take this issue up in a big way," Modvadia added. " After the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case, this is the second case during Modi's rule."

<http://www.deccanherald.com/content/23879/ishrat-jahan-encounter-fakejudicial-probe.html>

Ishrat Jahan encounter is fake, judicial probe

Ahmedabad, Sep 7 ,PTI : *In a setback to Gujarat government, a judicial probe says the 2004 killing of young college girl Ishrat Jahan and three others suspected to be on a mission to "kill" Chief Minister Narendra Modi was a case of "fake encounter" by the police.*

Metropolitan Magistrate S P Tamang's probe report submitted in the metropolitan court here today said the four persons who were also suspected to be having links with Pakistan-based terrorist outfit Lashkar-e-Toiba (LeT) were killed in cold blood by the police.

Magistrate Tamang in his report has claimed that the four were not linked to LeT.

Mumbai-based Ishrat(19) was killed in an encounter along with three other persons-- Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani-- by Detection of Crime Branch (DCB) officials near Ahmedabad on June 15 2004.

The then head of DCB D G Vanzara who is a prime accused in the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case is behind bars at present had claimed that all the four had links to LeT and

they were on a mission to kill Modi.

Last month the Gujarat High Court had formed a three-member committee headed by an officer of the rank of Additional Director General of Police (ADGP) to further investigate the Ishrat Jahan encounter case. This was done following a petition by Ishrat's mother Shamina, who alleged her daughter was killed in a fake encounter by Gujarat police.

After the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case, this was the second case where an encounter involving Gujarat police during the Narendra Modi rule is being probed again.

<http://www.deccanherald.com/content/24005/ishrats-family-wants-action-against.html>

Ishrat's family wants action against guilty Guj cops

Mumbai, Sep 8 (IANS): *'She was as patriotic and loved the country as much as you,' said an impassioned Nusrat, the younger sister of Mumbai collegian Ishrat Jahan who was shot dead and branded a traitor by Gujarat police and whose killing has been proved to be a 'fake encounter'.*

A day after an Ahmedabad court ruled that the killing of Ishrat Jahan, the 19-year-old college student gunned down with three of her friends in June 2004, was a "fake encounter", her family came out Tuesday to demand the sternest punishment possible for the guilty policemen.

Her younger sister Nusrat said the family knew right from the beginning that her killing in June 2004 was a "conspiracy". "She was as patriotic and loved the country as much as you and we do. We are happy that finally the blot on our family has been erased and she has been proved innocent," the 22-year-old said.

Nusrat added that all those people who had viewed the family with suspicion had been given an appropriate answer by the Ahmedabad court verdict. Her mother Shamima Jahan added tearfully that Ishrat's killing had branded their entire lives and affected the job and educational prospects of her six other children.

With the terrorist slur finally being removed, "our lives can come back on track", she said.

Ishrat, a resident of Mumbra suburb in Thane district, was a second year B.Sc student at Mumbai's Guru Nanak Khalsa College. Having lost her father two years before her death in 2002, she embroidered clothes and gave tuitions to help support her family of eight -- including her mother and six brothers and sisters.

On June 15, 2004, Ishrat and three of her friends, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were gunned down by Ahmedabad Police's Crime Branch (Detection) on the outskirts of the city.

Police claimed that the four were members of a Lashkar-e-Taiba module and were on a mission to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi. On Monday, that lie was nailed when an

Ahmedabad court ruled that the killings were a case of "fake encounter".

Her family expressed their gratitude to the media and their team of lawyers led by Vrinda Grover and Shilpa Shah for supporting them in their darkest hours.

[http://www.telegraphindia.com/1090908/jsp/nation/story\\_11464600.jsp](http://www.telegraphindia.com/1090908/jsp/nation/story_11464600.jsp)

Gujarat cops killed girl for raise: Report

OUR SPECIAL CORRESPONDENT

**Ahmedabad, Sept. 7:** Five years after she was shot dead as an alleged Lashkar-e-Toiba *fidayeen*, a magisterial inquiry has concluded that Mumbai college student Ishrat Jahan was murdered by policemen in a "cold-blooded, pre-planned" manner to get kudos from the chief minister and earn promotions.

The probe, conducted by Ahmedabad metropolitan magistrate S.P. Tamang, says the killing of Ishrat in 2004 was a "cold-blooded murder" carried out by some Gujarat policemen for petty gains.

"Ishrat Jahan was killed by Gujarat police in a cold-blooded, pre-planned way.... The police crime branch officials carried out the fake encounter for their personal gains, for promotions and other benefits. They wanted to show they were doing a great job, essentially to seek appreciation from the chief minister," says the 243-page report written in Gujarati. The investigation was started in 2004.

Gujarat High Court has already set up a three-member committee to investigate afresh the June 2004 killing of Ishrat by the crime branch, at least three of whose officials are now behind bars for allegedly staging another fake encounter the following year.

Ishrat, then 19 and a first-year science student at G.N. Khalsa College in Mumbai, was shot dead when travelling in a car on the outskirts of Ahmedabad on June 15, 2004.

Also in the car were Pune-based Javed Sheikh alias Pranesh Pillai, Ajmal Ali Rana from Kashmir and Zeeshan Johar from Pakistan. Ishrat was apparently known to Javed, who, the police claimed, had trained in terror camps in Pakistan.

The city crime branch, then headed by the now jailed IPS officer D.G. Vanzara, had claimed that all four were Lashkar operatives on a mission to kill chief minister Narendra Modi.

Vanzara, Rajkumar Pandian, also an IPS officer, and Narendra Amin, the then deputy superintendent of police, were among the crime branch officers involved in the “encounter”.

All three are at present lodged in Sabarmati Central Jail for the alleged fake encounter in which Sohrabuddin Shaikh was killed in November 2005.

The metropolitan magistrate’s report says Ishrat was “illegally” picked up by Gujarat police on June 12, 2004, from Mumbai along with her friend Javed alias Pranesh. They were brought to Ahmedabad where they were killed on the night of June 14. The “encounter” was shown to have occurred on June 15.

The report mentions by name several top bosses of Gujarat police at that time, such as then commissioner K.R. Kaushik, joint commissioner (crime branch) P.P. Pandey and Vanzara. “These officers wanted to get appreciation from the chief minister which is why they planned the cold-blooded murder of Ishrat Jahan, labelling her a terrorist out to kill the chief minister,” says the report.

The findings will be placed before the high court which is monitoring the case, said Mukul Sinha, the advocate for Ishrat’s mother Shamima Kausar, who has been waging a long battle for justice.

Government spokesman Jaynarayan Vyas refused to comment. “I don’t have any brief about this issue. Please contact the home minister,” he said. Home minister Amit Shah could not be reached for comment.

<http://www.dailypioneer.com/201184/Judge-says-Ishrat-Jahan-encounter-fake.html>

## **Judge says Ishrat Jahan encounter fake**

**Rathin Das | Ahmedabad**

More than five years after the city police had shot down four people in the outskirts of the city, a Metropolitan Judge's report has disclosed that the 'encounter' was fake.

Mumbai-based college girl Ishrat Jahan and three other young men were shot down by the Crime Branch of police on June 15, 2004 in the eastern suburb of city. The police had claimed it to be an encounter as the four people were heading towards Gandhinagar to eliminate Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

Metropolitan Judge SP Tamang in his report said that the so called "encounter" was stage-managed by the Crime Branch of the city police, an allegation made by the human rights activists that time too.

The "encounter" team was led by IPS officer DG Vanzara who is now in jail for another fake encounter killing better known as the 'Sohrabuddin case'. The 243-page report said that the police team had staged the encounter for their personal interest of gaining appreciation of Chief Minister Narendra Modi and thus get promotions.

The Crime Branch sleuths had kidnapped the four from Mumbai on June 12, 2004 and brought them to Ahmedabad and killed them in cold blood, disclosed the report by Metropolitan Judge SP Tamang.

Besides, Crime Branch Assistant Commissioner DG Vanzara, the report by Metropolitan Judge Tamang also implicates then Ahmedabad Police Commissioner KR Kaushik, Joint Commissioner (Crime Branch) PP Pandey and DCP (Crime Branch) NK Amin who too is now in custody in connection with the death of Sohrabuddin Sheikh in fake encounter.

The report revealed that Ishrat Jehan's autopsy indicated that rigor mortis had started between 11.00 pm to 12.00 am of June 14 signifying that she was killed before June 15, 2004 and the police merely fired at her dead body while staging the encounter.

<http://www.dailypioneer.com/201194/Ishrat-encounter-was-not-fake-Modi-Govt.html>

## **Ishrat encounter was not fake: Modi Govt**

**Pioneer news service | Ahmedabad/New Delhi**

The Gujarat Government on Tuesday dismissed Justice Tamang panel report in the Ishrat Jahan killing and said it was not a fake encounter.

Addressing a press conference, state government spokesperson Jay Narayan Vyas said, "Justice Tamang report is invalid and the Gujarat government will challenge it," adding that the "encounter was not fake."

Vyas said Magistrate Tamang prepared the report in a "hurry", without giving Gujarat government a chance to express its views. He said the panel did not give chance to either the Gujarat government to place its side nor did it allow the accused police officers to defend themselves.

Vyas also dragged the Centre into the whole controversy by pointing out that the Centre had declared Ishrat and her associate Javed as LeT operatives with links with a Pakistani national Muzzamil in Pakistan.

The Tamang panel on Monday said the 2004 killing of young college girl Ishrat Jahan and three others suspected to be on a mission to "kill" Chief Minister Narendra Modi was a case of "fake encounter" stage managed by the by the police, which killed them in cold blood.

The report said Ishrat, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were killed in a fake encounter on the outskirts of the city on June 15, 2004 and they were not linked with Pakistan-based terror outfit Lashker-e-Toiba, as claimed by the police.

Meanwhile, in Delhi while the BJP has defended the Narendra Modi, the Congress and CPI(M) have slammed the Gujarat government over the fake encounter allegations.

Senior BJP leader Venkaiah Naidu has said Gujarat Chief Minister cannot be held responsible for everything that happens in the state.

But holding Modi squarely responsible for the Ishrat's killing, Law Minister M Veerappa Moily said Modi would have been in "some other place" if the Ishrat Jahan fake encounter had taken place in a foreign country.

He told reporters that Modi could be headed for bigger trouble as "there are many such cases which are coming up now. If more investigations are conducted, more skeletons may tumble".

Noting that the law will take its own course, he said the revelations in the Ishrat Jahan encounter was a "very serious matter for the country and....Any other foreign country, Narendra Modi would have been in some other place".

Terming the incident as "most unfortunate", Moily said "many things are done brutally and inhuman things are being done".

The CPI(M) has demanded resignation of Modi and said he should take moral responsibility for the killing of a college girl and three others in a fake encounter five years ago.

"The targeted killings of persons belonging to the minority community by the state police

reveals the state of affairs under the Narendra Modi government," the CPI(M) Politburo said in a statement.

"The enquiry has revealed the hand of senior police officials including the then Ahmedabad Police Commissioner and DIG Vanzara who is now facing trial for another fake encounter killing -- of Soharabuddin Sheikh and his wife," the statement said. The Politburo demanded immediate action to arrest and prosecute all the police personnel involved in these murders.

"Exemplary punishment has to be meted out in this case as the crime has been committed by those entrusted with upholding the law. Given the spate of illegal encounter killings which took place under the encouragement of the state government, Modi should take moral responsibility and quit office," the statement added.

<http://www.hindu.com/2009/09/08/stories/2009090856670100.htm>

### **Ishrat Jahan killing also a fake encounter: probe report**

Manas Dasgupta

*Vanzara, among police officers, named for "cold-blooded murder"*

AHMEDABAD: In yet another setback to the Narendra Modi government, the Ahmedabad metropolitan magistrate, S.P. Tamang, has ruled that the June 2004 killing of Ishrat Jahan and three others was also a case of "fake encounter."

In his 243-page, hand-written report, Mr. Tamang has named the then "encounter specialist" of the Gujarat police, D.G. Vanzara, among others, accused in the "cold-blooded murder" of the teenaged girl and the three others.

Mr. Vanzara and several other policemen are already in jail in connection with the killing of Soharabuddin Sheikh, which the government confessed before the Supreme Court was a case of "fake encounter."

The probe report comes even as a special three-member team of top police officers of the State appointed by the Gujarat High Court for a fresh investigation into the Ishrat Jahan encounter is seized of the matter.

Claiming that Ishrat and the three others were killed by the police officers for their personal interest — to get promotions and appreciation from the Chief Minister — Mr. Tamang appended a list of top police officers, running to about two pages, whom he held responsible for the fake encounter. Besides Mr. Vanzara and his then deputy in the Crime Branch police, N. K. Amin, who along with Mr. Vanzara was arrested in the Soharabuddin case, the list includes the then Ahmedabad Police Commissioner, K.R. Kaushik, the then chief of the Crime Branch, P.P. Pandey, and another alleged encounter specialist Tarun Barot.

Mr. Tamang's report said the Crime Branch police "kidnapped" Ishrat and the others from Mumbai on June 12 and brought them to Ahmedabad. The four were killed on the night of June 14 in police custody, but the police claimed that an "encounter" took place the next morning on the outskirts of Ahmedabad. That rigor mortis set in between 11 p.m. and midnight the previous night clearly pointed to the fact that the police pumped bullets into Ishrat's lifeless body to substantiate the encounter theory.

The report said explosives, rifles and other weapons allegedly found in the car, in which the four victims were "travelling to Ahmedabad from Mumbai," and some of the weapons found on their person were all "planted" by the police.

Mr. Tamang said there was no evidence to link Ishrat Jahan and another victim, Javed Sheikh, with the Pakistan-based terror group, Lashkar-e-Taiba. Neither was there anything to establish that they had "come" to Gujarat to kill Mr. Modi.

The police then claimed that Ishrat, a resident of Mumbra near Mumbai; Javed Sheikh, son of Gopinath Pillai of Kerala; and Pakistani citizens Amjad Ali Rana and Jishan Jauhar were connected with the LeT and were coming to Gujarat to assassinate Mr. Modi to avenge the 2002 communal riots.

[http://epaper.hindustantimes.com/ArticleText.aspx?article=08\\_09\\_2009\\_007\\_001&word=&mode=1](http://epaper.hindustantimes.com/ArticleText.aspx?article=08_09_2009_007_001&word=&mode=1)

'This is first step towards justice'

5 YEARS ON, Ishrat's family feels vindicated after judicial probe reveals Mumbra teen was killed in fake encounter by Gujarat police

Susamma Kurian [susamma.kurian@hindustantimes.com](mailto:susamma.kurian@hindustantimes.com)

MUMBRA: Ishrat Jahan's family feels vindicated. A judicial probe in Gujarat has confirmed what they had been maintaining all along. That she was killed in a fake encounter.

"We are very happy that finally Ishrat's innocence has been proved. This is the first step towards justice. We have been saying that it was a fake encounter and that Ishrat was murdered," said her sister Musarrat Jahan (22), who works as a receptionist at a hotel.

Ishrat, Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana, and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were gunned down by the Ahmedabad police on the outskirts of that city on June 15, 2004. The police had claimed the four were Lashkar-eTayyeba terrorists out to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

The police team was led by Deputy Commissioner of Police DG Vanzara, who is currently in jail in the Sohrabuddin Sheikh fake encounter case.

Ishrat's mother Shamima Kausar (45) said: " We want justice. We want to remove the stain of my daughter being branded a terrorist. We had to suffer a lot these five years. I'll keep fighting till we get justice.

It was a double tragedy as I had lost my daughter and she was branded a terrorist."

Shamima said she first heard of Ishrat's death when a TV channel announced on June 15, 2004, that she had died in an encounter. " I did not even know what an encounter was then."

The last time Shamima saw her 19-year-old daughter, a second-year Science student of Guru Nanak Khalsa College, was when she left home on June 11, 2004, saying she was going to Nashik for a job.

Ishrat called later in the day to say she had reached Nashik and that she would call later.

In the five years since her death, the family that lives in Rashid Compound in the Muslim-dominated Mumbra area, has struggled to survive.

Shamima said the allegation against Ishrat meant her siblings found it difficult to get jobs.

The family's eldest daughter Zeenat Jahan (25) does not work and is not married.

Ishrat's brother Anwar Iqbal (21) teaches at a computer coaching centre in Mumbra. He said he could not get jobs outside the locality. "I want all those responsible for her death to be punished," he said.

The three youngest children of the family are still students.

Nuzhat (19) is in first-year of college while Nusrat (17) attends junior college. The baby of the family, Amanullah (13), does not attend school but plans to appear for the exams privately.

On Monday, they were all at home facing TV cameras and offering sweets to wellwishers. WHO WAS ISHRAT?

ISHRAT JAHAN was a 19-yearold secondyear Science student of Guru Nanak Khalsa College at King's Circle.

She was the second of seven siblings. The family, who live in Rashid Compound in the Muslim-dominated Mumbra area in Thane district, are originally from Bihar.

Ishrat, who lost her father two years before the encounter, gave tuitions and did embroidery work to support the family.

THE CASE Ishrat Jahan, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were gunned down by the Ahmedabad police on the outskirts of that city, on June 15, 2004.

The Gujarat police had claimed that the four were linked to terrorist organisation Lashkar-eTayyeba and were planning to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

The police team was led by then Deputy Commissioner of Police D.G. Vanzara, who is currently in jail in the Sohrabuddin Sheikh fake encounter case.

Though Ishrat's family insisted that she was innocent, the police alleged that she knew Javed.

Ishrat had left her house on June 12, three days before she was killed.

The case stirred up a hornet's nest as politicians and the Maharashtra State Minorities Commission demanding an inquiry into the incident.

The Maharashtra police could not find anything that could implicate Ishrat.

The Gujarat High Court formed a Special Investigation Team to probe the case. In August, the Gujarat High Court ordered a three-member committee of top police officers, led by state Additional Director General of Police Pramod Kumar, to investigate the encounter following a petition filed by Ishrat's mother, Shamima.

<http://www.asianage.com/presentation/leftnavigation/news/india/ishrat-encounter-fake-probe.aspx>

## **Ishrat encounter fake: Probe**

**Deepal Trivedi**

Ahmedabad

Sept. 7: A judicial inquiry by a metropolitan magistrate has revealed that 2004 encounter of Ishrat Jahan and three others was fake.

Nineteen-year-old Ishrat was killed along with three others in Ahmedabad in 2004. Ishrat's mother Shamima had sought a CBI investigation in the case and a re-opening of the case.

Metropolitan magistrate S.P. Tamang's report was submitted in the metropolitan court here on Monday, which said that they were killed in cold blood by the police.

Magistrate Tamang in his report has claimed that they were not linked to Pakistan-based terrorist outfit LeT.

Mumbai-based Ishrat Jahan (19) was killed in an encounter along with three other persons by Detection of Crime Branch (DCB) officials in June 2004.

The then head of DCB, D.G. Vanzara, who is a prime accused in the Sohrabuddin encounter case, is behind bars at present. He had claimed that all the four had Lashkar-e-Tayyaba links and they were on a mission to kill Gujarat chief minister Narendra Modi.

The three others — Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali, alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana, and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani — were also killed in the encounter.

The Gujarat high court had in the last month formed a three-member committee headed by an officer of the rank of additional director general of police (ADGP) to further investigate the 2004 encounter case of Ishrat Jahan.

Earlier this week, the high court had asked the government to suggest names of three senior police officers. Now a team has been constituted.

The two members of the probe committee selected by the court are inspector general Mohan Jha and deputy inspector general J.K. Bhatt.

Justice Jhaveri had last week asked the state government to furnish a list of seniormost additional DGP level officials to the court and had said that the court will pick up three officials to form the team.

After the Soharabuddin Sheikh fake encounter case, this the second case where courts have ordered further probe on the veracity of the encounter carried out by state police.

According to the details of the case, Ishrat, along with three others, was killed in an alleged encounter by the DCB near Kotarpur Waterworks in Ahmedabad on June 15, 2004.

[http://epaper.hindustantimes.com/ArticleText.aspx?article=08\\_09\\_2009\\_001\\_019&keyword=&mode=1](http://epaper.hindustantimes.com/ArticleText.aspx?article=08_09_2009_001_019&keyword=&mode=1)

Mumbra girl was killed in fake Guj encounter: Probe

AHMEDABAD/THANE: The 2004 police encounter in which Mumbra college girl Ishrat Jahan and three others were gunned down in Ahmedabad was fake and executed in cold blood, a judicial probe has said.

On Monday, the panel appointed by the court to investigate the encounter submitted its report.

"We are happy that Ishrat's innocence has been proved.

This is the first step towards justice... We want to remove the stain that my daughter has been branded a terrorist," said Ishrat's mother Shamima Kausar whose petition seeking CBI investigation prompted the Gujarat High Court to appoint the panel this August.

On June 15, 2004, Ishrat and three others -- Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani -- were gunned down by the Gujarat police who claimed they were linked to Lashkar-e-Tayyeba and were planning to kill Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

Magistrate S.P. Tamang, conducting the probe, said the four victims had no links to Lashkar.

The report said the encounter was "planned" and executed "mercilessly" -- the victims were shot from a "close range".

The judicial probe has stated that the senior police officers, including then city police commissioner K.R. Kaushik, planned the encounter to impress Modi, get promotion and secure their positions.

Ishrat Jahan's family feels vindicated. A judicial probe in Gujarat has confirmed what they had been maintaining all along. That she was killed in a fake encounter.

"We are very happy that finally Ishrat's innocence has been proved. This is the first step towards justice. We have been saying that it was a fake encounter and that Ishrat was murdered," said her sister Musarrat Jahan (22), who works as a receptionist at a hotel.

Ishrat, Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana, and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were gunned down by the Ahmedabad police on the outskirts of that city on June 15, 2004. The police had claimed the four were Lashkar-eTayyeba terrorists out to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

The police team was led by Deputy Commissioner of Police DG Vanzara, who is currently in jail in the Sohrabuddin Sheikh fake encounter case.

Ishrat's mother Shamima Kausar (45) said: " We want justice. We want to remove the stain of my daughter being branded a terrorist. We had to suffer a lot these five years. I'll keep fighting till we get justice.

It was a double tragedy as I had lost my daughter and she was branded a terrorist."

Shamima said she first heard of Ishrat's death when a TV channel announced on June 15, 2004, that she had died in an encounter. " I did not even know what an encounter was then."

The last time Shamima saw her 19-year-old daughter, a second-year Science student of Guru Nanak Khalsa College, was when she left home on June 11, 2004, saying she was going to Nashik for a job.

Ishrat called later in the day to say she had reached Nashik and that she would call later.

In the five years since her death, the family that lives in Rashid Compound in the Muslim-dominated Mumbra area, has struggled to survive.

Shamima said the allegation against Ishrat meant her siblings found it difficult to get jobs.

The family's eldest daughter Zeenat Jahan (25) does not work and is not married.

Ishrat's brother Anwar Iqbal (21) teaches at a computer coaching centre in Mumbra. He said he could not get jobs outside the locality. "I want all those responsible for her death to be punished," he said.

The three youngest children of the family are still students.

Nuzhat (19) is in first-year of college while Nusrat (17) attends junior college. The baby of the family, Amanullah (13), does not attend school but plans to appear for the exams privately.

On Monday, they were all at home facing TV cameras and offering sweets to wellwishers. WHO WAS ISHRAT?

ISHRAT JAHAN was a 19-year-old second-year Science student of Guru Nanak Khalsa College at King's Circle.

She was the second of seven siblings. The family, who live in Rashid Compound in the Muslim-dominated Mumbra area in Thane district, are originally from Bihar.

Ishrat, who lost her father two years before the encounter, gave tuitions and did embroidery work to support the family.

THE CASE Ishrat Jahan, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani were gunned down by the Ahmedabad police on the outskirts of that city, on June 15, 2004.

The Gujarat police had claimed that the four were linked to terrorist organisation Lashkar-eTayyeba and were planning to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

The police team was led by then Deputy Commissioner of Police D.G. Vanzara, who is currently in jail in the Sohrabuddin Sheikh fake encounter case.

Though Ishrat's family insisted that she was innocent, the police alleged that she knew Javed.

Ishrat had left her house on June 12, three days before she was killed.

The case stirred up a hornet's nest as politicians and the Maharashtra State Minorities Commission demanding an inquiry into the incident.

The Maharashtra police could not find anything that could implicate Ishrat.

The Gujarat High Court formed a Special Investigation Team to probe the case. In August, the Gujarat High Court ordered a three-member committee of top police officers, led by state Additional Director General of Police Pramod Kumar, to investigate the encounter following a petition filed by Ishrat's mother, Shamima.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=MIRRORNEW&BaseHref=AMIR/2009/09/08&PageLabel=4&EntityId=Ar00400&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

# Gujarat police's one more lie

## ISHRAT JAHAN ENCOUNTER WAS MURDER: JUDICIAL PROBE

**Despite being a good citizen, Ishrat Jahan was declared a terrorist and killed in encounter, states magisterial report**

**ZAHID QURESHI AND VIJAY ZALA**

The Gujarat police had faked the encounter in which college student Ishrat Jahan and three of her friends were killed on the outskirts of Ahmedabad on June 15, 2004, said a magisterial probe. Submitting a 252-page report to chief metropolitan magistrate on Monday, metropolitan magistrate S P Tamang rubbished the police theory that the four were shot dead because they were Lashkar-e-Toiba fidayees on a mission to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

In the report, the judge stated that the policemen killed Ishrat Jahan, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali Akbar Ali Rana alias Rajkumar and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani alias Janbaaz in cold blood to get public recognition, promotion and appreciation from the chief minister.

Tamang said Ishrat Jahan was well-educated and came from a good family. "She conducted tuitions and worked hard to support her family. Despite being a good citizen, she was declared a terrorist and killed in an encounter," the report stated.

### **REPORT IN 25 DAYS**

IN A LETTER dated August 12, 2009, the chief metropolitan magistrate ordered Tamang to begin a probe into the Ishrat Jahan encounter under section 176 of the CrPC. Tamang took down statements of Ishrat's mother Shameema Kausar, her brother Anwar along with Pillai's father and wife. He also checked the evidence. Twenty-five days later, he submitted the report which the chief magistrate will forward to the state government as well as the human rights commission.

The report damned the then police commissioner K R Kaushik and the then joint police commissioner (Crime Branch) P P Pande. It also slammed D G Vanzara, G L Singhal and N K Amin who were additional police commissioner (Crime Branch), ACP (Crime Branch) and ACP (Crime Branch) respectively during that time. The report also named 10 inspectors, 10 constables and commandos who gunned down the four. Vanzara and Amin are already behind bars in connection with the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case.

The report stated, "The policemen illegally detained Ishrat Jahan and three others in Mumbai on June 12, 2004. They hid the four at a city farmhouse on June 13 and 14.

Early on June 15, they killed the four people near Sardarnagar-Kotarapur.

“Rigor mortis had set completely in Ishrat Jahan’s body. The contents of her stomach showed that food had been digested properly. The four died due to shock and haemorrhage caused by police bullets. The deaths were planned and committed in cold blood. The policemen are responsible for Ishrat Jahan’s death.”

### **STAIN LIVES ON**

AFTER THE Sohrabuddin fake encounter case, this is the second case where an encounter involving Gujarat police during Narendra Modi rule is being probed again.

Following the inquiry report, the court can order the arrest of the guilty policemen on an appeal by Ishrat’s family. Also top government functionaries can be made party to the case.

Last month, the Gujarat High Court had formed a three-member committee headed by an officer of the rank of Additional Director General of Police (ADGP) to investigate the encounter. This was done following a petition by Ishrat’s mother Shameema, who alleged her daughter was killed in a fake encounter by Gujarat police.

Advocate Mukul Sinha, who represents Shameema, said, “The three-member panel will have to take the report into consideration while conducting their inquiry. Another writ filed by Pillai’s father Gopinath at High Court is up for hearing on Tuesday.”

### **THE DEAD WERE NOT PAKISTANIS: REPORT**

METROPOLITAN magistrate S P Tamang, in his report on the Ishrat Jahan encounter submitted on Monday, refuted Gujarat police’s claim that two of Ishrat Jahan’s friends were Pakistanis.

“Amjad Ali Akbar Ali Rana alias Rajkumar and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani alias Janbaaz were not Pakistanis. They were Muslims. So, the police declared them to be terrorists from the Lashkar-e-Toiba outfit and killed them,” the report stated.

The case bears great similarities to the Sohrabuddin fake encounter. Senior police officers D G Vanzara and N K Amin, accused of shooting Ishrat Jahan and friends, are already in jail for staging Sohrabuddin’s encounter.

Like in Ishrat Jahan encounter, the police at that time had also claimed that Sohrabuddin, belonged to ISI-supported terrorist group Lashkar-e-Toiba and was planning to assassinate Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi to avenge the death of Muslims killed in the 2002 Gujarat violence.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=MIRRORNEW&BaseHref=AMIR/2009/09/08&PageLabel=5&EntityId=Ar00500&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

Gujarat EDN

## **Encounter was marked by usual suspect settings**

### **AHMEDABAD MIRROR BUREAU**

Ishrat Jahan Raza and three others were gunned down in an encounter by a team of Detection of Crime Branch (DCB) at Kotarapur near Indira Bridge on Ahmedabad-

Gandhinagar highway on the morning of June 15, 2004. The three others travelling with her in an Indica car with a Maharashtra registration number were identified as Javed Shaikh alias Pranesh Pillai of Mumbai, and two alleged Pakistani nationals Amjad Ali Rana and Jishan Johar.

Metropolitan magistrate S P Tamang's pronouncement made on Monday was preceded by a lengthy trial, setting up of a three member panel to re-investigate the case. That re-investigation is still on. Magistrate Tamang, however, based his pronouncement on an Act 176 of CrPC Code (1973) which authorises a magistrate to conduct a court inquiry. He started his inquiry on August 13, 2009, and submitted the report in the space of 25 days on September 7.

The DCB claimed four, including Ishrat a student from Mumbra in Thane district, were operatives of Lashkar-e-Toiba and were on a mission to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi and senior BJP leaders to avenge the Gujarat riots. IPS officers D G Vanzara and Rajkumar Pandian and senior cop Narendra Amin were among the police personnel involved in the encounter.

#### **USUAL MODUS OPERANDI**

THE ENCOUNTER raised suspicion for the word go as fit the usual police modus operandi in such incidents and the circumstances that led to the killing — the early hours when incident took place when roads are deserted, the cops come off unscathed, all accused are shot, none gets to flee etc. Ishrat's mother Shameema Kausar contested the police claim.

Investigations into the case conducted under the supervision of then DySP Parikshitaben Gurjar concluded that the incident was not a fake encounter. According to Gurjar's findings, the four along with Ishrat Jahan were LeT operatives and two of them were from Pakistan. Ishrat's husband Javed, originally Praneshkumar Pillai who had converted to Islam and changed his name to marry her, had taken weapons training in Pakistan, Gurjar's investigations revealed. The case was then closed by filing a summary report before the Ahmedabad POTA court.

However, Ishrat's mother Shameema maintained that her daughter was not linked to any terrorist organisation, and that it was a cold-blooded murder. She filed a petition in the Gujarat High Court through her advocate Mukul Sinha seeking fresh investigations, this time by the CBI, in the case. Based on the plea, Justice K S Jhaveri of the HC directed the state government to submit a list of police officers of the rank of Additional Director General of police to explore the possibility of setting up a three-member committee for a fresh probe into the killing of Ishrat Jahan.

#### **HC FORMED PROBE PANEL**

ON AUGUST 8, 2009 the High Court decided to form a team of three high ranking police officers to bring out the truth behind the encounter. The court fixed the final order for August 12 after public prosecutor J M Panchal and Advocate General Kamal Trivedi submitted that the state government would furnish a list of ADGs then.

The HC subsequently constituted a three-member committee from a list submitted by the government counsel. The committee consisted of Mohan Jha (Jt Commissioner Sector I), J K Bhatt (Range DIG, Gandhinagar) and Pramod Kumar (Addl DIG Vadodara range). Justice Jhaveri, though, refused to hand over the probe to the CBI.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=MIRRORNEW&BaseHref=AMIR/2009/09/08&PageLabel=6&EntityId=Ar00601&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

Gujarat EDN

## **For Ishrat Jahan's family, Eid will be special this year**

**The Mumbai girl's mother Shameema Kausar says the family's claim that she was innocent has been proved true**

**NILESH NIKADE**

For the family of Ishrat Jahan, who was killed in an alleged encounter on June 15, 2004, Eid came couple of weeks early.

A metropolitan court at Ahmedabad in Gujarat ruled Ishrat was killed in a staged encounter. Ishrat's killing by the Gujarat police had created a sensation across the nation, as the Gujarat police claimed that the 19-year-old student of the Khalsa college, Matunga, along with three other males.

Gujarat Police claimed Ishrat was part of a Lashkare-Taiba group that was going to gun down Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi. Ishrat's family, however, strongly denied these claims and have been fighting in the court to re-open the investigations and an impartial probe by the CBI into the killings.

"For us, the real Eid is today. Our claims have been proved to be true," said Ishrat's mother Shameema Kausar who couldn't control her tears even as she remembered her daughter.

She said, "Ishrat's encounter turned our lives upside down. She was a bright student and had taken admission for science stream. She used to take tuitions to run family. Among my four daughters and two sons, none could complete their education. We survived by doing zari work and recently my son Anwar has managed to bag a job."

The family fought the battle with the help of two local social activists Abdul Rauf Lala and Munna Sahil. Both of them helped family with making correspondence with courts and authorities in Gujarat. Lala said, "The family has survived tough times and we supported them in whichever possible ways.

The court heard our plea after we repeatedly pointed at Ishrat's post-mortem report, which indicated that she was shot at point blank. The magistrate's report has only increased our faith in judiciary."

Mushrat Jahan, 22, was upfront and confident in answering every question thrown at her by TV news reporters. Her eyes were beaming with joy and also there was a sense of relief on her face. Her neighbours were startled, as they had never seen Mushrat so charged before and knew her as a shy and quiet girl.

There was a valid reason for this change in Mushrat's attitude. She is a younger sister of Ishrat Jahan, whose encounter by Gujrat police was ruled as fake by the Ahmedabad Metropolitan Court on Monday. "My sister was never a terrorist, but the allegation had

made our lives miserable. We had little support from society and were forced to live life in anonymity during these years,” said Mushrat, who changed her residence twice in past four years.

Gujarat High Court had ordered a detailed probe in this matter last month, which is being conducted by the team of three IPS officers. Meanwhile, on Monday, a magistrate’s enquiry in this case initiated in 2005 revealed that the encounter was fake.

Deputy chairperson of the state legislative council and local Nationalist Congress Party leader Vasant Davkhare, too, was relieved by this news. Davkhare had courted trouble after he had offered help to the family then.

He said, “This proved that help I offered to the Ishrat Jahan’s family was genuine. I will definitely try to meet this family and offer more help.”

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Client.asp?showST=true&Skin=MIRRORNEW&Daily=AMIR&BaseHref=AMIR/2009/09/08&Enter=true&GZ=T>

Gujarat EDN

## **‘Cops killed my son for promotion’**

**Gopinath Pillai, father of Javed alias Pranesh Pillai who was shot dead along with Ishrat and three others, is ‘not surprised’ by the probe report; says the fake encounter was a plan to give Modi political mileage**

**ZAHID QURESHI & VIJAY ZALA**

I always knew it was a fake encounter. The judicial probe report does not surprise me at all. My son was not a terrorist. The cops did it to give Modi a political mileage and receive promotions,” says Gopinath Pillai, 72, the distraught father of Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai who was killed by the police along with Ishrat Jahan and two others near Ahmedabad airport on June 15, 2004.

The then head of DCB D G Vanzara, who is a prime accused in the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case, and behind bars at present, had claimed that all the four were LeT fidayees and were on a mission to kill Modi. “They had held my son captive at the same farmhouse where Sohrabuddin and Kausarbi were kept before being executed. They killed my son and three others just four months before they had killed the couple, and that too in the same manner,” said Pillai. A native of Nooranad near Mavelikkara in Kerala, Pillai spoke to Mirror on Monday evening following Metropolitan Magistrate S P Tamang’s probe report that said the four were killed in cold blood by the police.

### **‘THOSE COCONUTS WERE NOT BOMBS’**

“I CAN never forget the press conference addressed by Vanzara then. He told the media that coconuts found in my son’s car were used to fill explosive material and make bombs. What rubbish! The coconuts were from our plantation here. Pranesh had come to visit us in May 2004 and was here till June first week. When he was leaving, I had packed the coconuts for him,” he said. “My son was picked up from a car workshop near

Ahmednagar railway station when he had gone to repair a puncture. The workers there will tell you everything. Two cops clad in plain shirts, khakhi trousers, and wearing red shoes, had picked him up from there. Five days later, they dumped his body along with three others, like sardines, on a road in Ahmedabad.”

Pillai says the police theory about his son and the others being terrorists was “without any logic”. “The cops say they fired 18 rounds from a pistol at them and they (Javed and the other three) fired 58 rounds from the AK-56 rifle, how come not a single cop got wounded? How come, not a single tree in the vicinity was hit by a bullet?”

He also ridicules the cops’ theory that ‘terrorists’ began firing at them. “The journalists who saw the dead bodies told me that the pistol found at the spot was rusted and looked like it had not been used in a long time. It could not have been used by the ‘terrorists’ as the cop had claimed then. When the cops realised their folly, they cleaned the weapon and kept it back there. Even journalists are witness to this.”

#### **HEARING ON PILLAI’S WRIT TODAY**

PILLAI HAD visited Ahmedabad on August 29 after being summoned by Tamang. “I have also filed a writ petition in the Gujarat High Court. Dr Mukul Sinha, N N Patel, Amrish Patel, Rajesh Mankad and Kalpesh Sutharia have agreed to fight my case,” said Pillai. The petition will be heard on Tuesday. The HC had recently formed a team of three high-ranking police officers to probe the case. This was done following a petition by Ishrat’s mother Shameema, who alleged her daughter was killed in a fake encounter by Gujarat police. When Pillai moved SC for a fresh probe, it asked him to implead himself as party to Shameema’s petition.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=MIRRORNEW&BaseHref=MMIR/2009/09/08&PageLabel=2&EntityId=Ar00200&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

MM

## **‘Ishrat was murdered’**

**Judicial probe says Ishrat Jahan was declared terrorist and killed in encounter, despite being a good citizen**

**MIRROR BUREAU/PTI**

A judicial probe has concluded that the encounter in which Ishrat Jahan and three others were gunned down in 2004 was fake and was executed in cold blood by Gujarat police officers who suspected them of being on a mission to ‘kill’ Chief Minister Narendra Modi. The four were killed on the outskirts of Ahmedabad on June 15, 2004 by a police team, headed by D G Vanzara, claiming that they belonged to Pakistan-based terror outfit Lashkar-e-Toiba (LeT).

The report of the investigation conducted by Magistrate S P Tamang, which was

submitted in the metropolitan court in Ahmedabad on Monday, is a setback to the Modi government.

Tamang concluded that the victims — Mumbai-based college student Ishrat, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani — were not linked to LeT as claimed by the police. The report said that the police had shot the victims in ‘cold blood using their service revolver’. It said the encounter was ‘planned’ and executed ‘mercilessly’ by shooting the victims from ‘close range’.

The report said that police officers, including the then city police commissioner K R Kaushik, then JCP (crime branch) P P Pande, suspended DIG D G Vanzara, then ACP G L Singhal and ACP N K Amin, had planned this encounter for their selfish motives. The motive was to get a promotion, to secure their positions, to falsely show their work as the best, to impress on the CM. To achieve their goals, the report said, the officers illegally detained the four from Mumbai and brought them to Ahmedabad. It further alleged the police officers had believed that death of Muslim LeT operatives in an encounter would be easily accepted by everybody. The killings triggered a judicial probe under Section 176 of the CrPC, as it was a case of unnatural death.

At the same time, following a petition by Ishrat’s mother, the Gujarat HC had in August formed a three-member committee, headed by an officer of the rank of Additional Director General of Police (ADGP), to further investigate the encounter. After the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case, this became the second case of an encounter involving the Gujarat police during the Narendra Modi rule being probed again. Vanzara, now in prison, is the prime accused in the Sohrabuddin fake encounter case.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=MIRRORNEW&BaseHref=MMIR/2009/09/08&PageLabel=2&EntityId=Ar00202&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

MM

## **Today is our Eid, says mother**

**Family of 19-yr-old Khalsa College student Ishrat feel vindicated by findings of probe**

**NILESH NIKADE**

For the family of Ishrat Jahan, who was killed in an alleged encounter in June 2004, Eid came a couple of weeks early.

Ishrat’s killing had created a sensation across the nation, as the Gujarat Police claimed that the 19-year-old student of Khalsa College at Matunga was part of a LeT group that was going to gun down Gujarat Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

Ishrat’s family strongly refuted these claims and have been fighting to re-open the investigation. They want an impartial probe by the CBI.

“For us, the real Eid is today. Our claims have been proved to be true,” said Ishrat’s mother Shamima Kausar, who couldn’t control her tears as she remembered her daughter. “Ishrat’s encounter turned our lives upside down. She was a bright student and had taken admission in the Science stream. She used to teach other children to help run the family. My four daughters and two sons could not complete their education. We survive by doing zari work though my son Anwar managed to bag a job recently.”

Despite the hardships, the family was determined to ensure justice for Ishrat. They fought the legal battle with the help of social activists Abdul Rauf Lala and Munna Sahil. Both helped with the correspondence with courts and authorities in Gujarat.

Lala said, “The family has seen tough times and we supported them in whichever way possible. The court heard our plea after we repeatedly pointed to Ishrat’s post-mortem report, which indicated that she was shot at pointblank range. The magistrate’s report has only increased our faith in the judiciary.”

The report has brought back life into the family. Neighbours were startled to see Ishrat’s younger sister Mushrat, a shy 22-year-old, confidently answering questions thrown at her by TV reporters. Her eyes were beaming with joy and there was a sense of relief on her face.

“My sister was never a terrorist, but the allegation had made our lives miserable. We had little support from society and were forced to live life in anonymity,” said Mushrat, who changed residence twice in the past four years.

One man who had dared to extend support to the family was Vasant Davkhare, the deputy chairperson of the state legislative council. The NCP veteran was relieved by the probe report. “It proves that the help I offered to the family was genuine. I will definitely try to meet the family and offer more help.”

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=MIRRORNEW&BaseHref=MMIR/2009/09/08&PageLabel=2&EntityId=Ar00201&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

MM

## **‘COPS KILLED MY SON FOR PROMOTION’**

**Gopinath Pillai, father of Javed alias Pranesh Pillai who was shot dead along with Ishrat and three others, is ‘not surprised’ by the probe report; says the fake encounter was a plan to give Modi political mileage**

**ZAHID QURESHI AND RUTURAJ JADAV**

I always knew it was a fake encounter. The judicial probe report does not surprise me at all. My son was not a terrorist. The cops did it to give Modi political mileage and receive a promotion,” says Gopinath Pillai, 72, the distraught father of Javed Gulam Sheikh alias P K Pillai.

“They held my son captive at the same farm where Sohrabuddin and Kausarbi were

kept before being executed. They killed my son and three others just four months before they had killed the couple, and in the same manner,” said Pillai from Kerala.

“I can never forget the press conference addressed by Vanzara [who headed the police team]. He claimed that coconuts found in my son’s car were used to fill explosive material and make bombs. The coconuts were from our plantation here. Pranesh had come to visit us in May 2004 and was here till June first week. When he was leaving, I had packed the coconuts for him,” he said. “My son was picked up from a car workshop near Ahmednagar railway station [in Maharashtra] when he had gone to repair a puncture. The workers there will tell you everything. He was picked up by two cops clad in plain shirts and khakhi trousers. They were wearing red shoes. Five days later, they dumped his body, along with that of three others, on a road in Ahmedabad.”

“The cops claims that the four persons fired 18 rounds from a pistol and 58 rounds from the AK-56 rifle. How come not a single cop got wounded, not a single tree in the vicinity was hit by a bullet?”

He also ridicules the cops’ theory that ‘terrorists’ began firing at them. “The journalists who saw the dead bodies told me that the pistol found at the spot was rusted and looked like it had not been used in a long time. It could not have been used by the ‘terrorists’ as the cops had claimed. When they realised their folly, they cleaned the weapon and kept it back there. Even journalists are witness to this.” Pillai visited Ahmedabad on August 29 after being summoned by the court.

“I have also filed a writ petition in the Gujarat High Court. Dr Mukul Sinha, N N Patel, Amrish Patel, Rajesh Mankad and Kalpesh Sutharia have agreed to fight my case,” said Pillai. The HC had recently formed a team of three high ranking police officers to probe the case. This was done following a petition by Ishrat’s mother Shamina, who alleged her daughter was killed in a fake encounter by Gujarat police.

When Pillai moved the SC for a fresh probe, it asked him to implead himself as party to Kausar’s petition.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=ETNEW&BaseHref=ETM/2009/09/08&PageLabel=3&EntityId=Ar00303&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

ET

## **Another fake encounter in Gujarat exposed**

### **Ishrat, 3 Others Killed By Cops In Cold Blood: Judicial Probe**

**PTI AHMEDABAD**

THE encounter in which college girl Ishrat Jahan and three others were gunned down in 2004, for allegedly planning to kill chief minister Narendra Modi, was fake and executed in ‘cold blood’ by police officers for selfish motives, a judicial probe concluded on Monday.

The report of the investigation conducted by magistrate SP Tamang was submitted in the metropolitan court here and comes as a setback to the Narendra Modi government.

Mr Tamang in his report has concluded that four persons — Ishrat, Javed Ghulam Sheikh alias Pranesh Kumar Pillai, Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani —killed in an encounter on the outskirts of the city on June 15, 2004, were not linked with Pakistan-based terror outfit Lashkar-e-Toiba as claimed by the police.

Police had claimed that the four were LeT terrorists and were on a mission to kill Mr Modi. The report said police officers and their subordinates had shot the victims in “cold blood using their service revolver.”

It further said the encounter was “planned” and executed “mercilessly” by shooting the victims from “close range”. Even the autopsy report said the death of the four were due to bullet injuries, it added.

The report alleged that police officers including the then city police commissioner K R Kaushik, then JCP (crime branch) P P Pande, suspended DIG D G Vanzara, then ACP G L Singhal, and ACP N K Amin had planned this encounter for their selfish motives.

The report said the motive for senior police officers was to get promotion, to secure their positions, to falsely show their work as the best, to impress upon the chief minister and get his accolades.

The report said in order to achieve their goals the police officers hatched a plan and illegally detained the four from Mumbai and brought them to Ahmedabad.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=TOINew&BaseHref=TOIM/2009/09/08&PageLabel=2&EntityId=Ar00200&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

## **‘This will clear the blot on Ishrat’**

**Nitin Yeshwantrao | TNN**

Thane: Ishrat Jahan’s family wears a smile that barely conceals the anguish of losing their daughter. A Gujarat magisterial court’s ruling on Monday declaring the 2004 killing of the Mumbra girl a ‘fake encounter’ has brought them some comfort.

“We have lost our daughter and her absence will be felt. We were confident about her innocence and were aware that she has been murdered in cold blood. The court’s verdict has reinforced our faith in the judiciary,” said Shamima Kausar, mother of the Khalsa college student killed in June 2004, in Ahmedabad along with three other suspected ‘terrorists’.

The Gujarat ATS team had claimed that Ishrat and the three men were members of the Lashkar-e-Toiba and were plotting to kill Gujarat chief minister Narendra Modi. These claims however now stand questioned after the court’s order on Monday, conveyed to Ishrat’s family by lawyers around 6 pm. “It is the holy month of Ramzan and we were about to offer namaz when the news was conveyed to us. Our family has suffered a lot in the last five years, but this verdict will help clear the blot on Ishrat. We can lead a respectable life now,” said Musharat, Ishrat’s younger sister.

The family's one-bedroom flat on the fourth floor of the rundown Nazish Apartment at Kausa was brimming with newsmen and visitors from political parties.

"Justice has been done to Ishrat. But we have paid a very heavy price for that as she is no longer in our midst," said Shaikh Raza Anwar, her younger brother who is employed in a software firm. Ishrat was the only earning member among her three sisters and two brothers after her father had died in 2004.

A local community leader Rauf Lala recalled the fateful day when news of Ishrat's alleged terror links was conveyed. "On June 11 Ishrat had called her family and informed them that she was in Nashik. That was the last time they heard from her. A few days later the police informed us of her death. We refused to take their lie and fought to prove her innocence in the court. What came to our aid was the post mortem report which showed that she had been shot at close range and the bullet had simply ripped apart her brains. The high court considered our argument and our lawyers Mukul Sinha and Shilpa Shah doggedly pursued the case and proved how the Modi government was responsible for the killing of an innocent girl," he said.

### **A SORDID STORY**

**June 12, 2004** | Ahmedabad crime branch picks up Ishrat Jahan Reza and Javed Shaikh from Mumbai

**June 14** | Javed, Ishrat and two others, Amjadali Rana and Jisan Johar, are killed near Ahmedabad

**June 15** | Encounter comes to light

**2004:** Metropolitan magistrate initiates judicial inquiry

**August 2004** | Ishrat's mother Shamima Ka usar files a petition in Gujarat HC for a thorough probe

**2007** | Shamima changes her lawyer after IPS officer DG Vanzara is held in Sohrabuddin Shaikh case

**2008** | Shamima files an application in HC to expedite the proceedings

**August 12, 2009** | Gujarat HC's justice KS Jhaveri orders an IPS officers' panel to probe the case

**August 12** | Chief metropolitan magistrate asks magistrate S P Tamang to conduct an inquiry and submit a report. Tamang initiates the probe the very next day

**September 7** | Magistrate Tamang submits report stating the encounter was a fake

**Disgraced cop's plot gone phut**

**I Three days before Jagannath rath yatra in 2004, there were rumours the Ahmedabad crime branch will do something "spectacular". Early on June 15, now jailed IPS officer DG Vanzara and his men said four LeT operatives out to kill chief minister Narendra Modi had been shot dead after a dramatic chase I Police said they found automatic weapons, ammunition, satellite phones & "coconuts dipped in chemical", meant to be used as improvised explosive devices during Rath Yatra I The story Vanzara gave out then was that the encounter took place around 4.30 am near Kotarpur waterworks after the police chased the terrorists who were in a blue Indica I The crime branch team was in a Maruti Gypsy, headed by ACPs Narendra Amin and G L Singhal, chasing the Indica which allegedly rammed into a divider I The cops said "terrorist" Akbarali Rana jumped out and fired at the cops from an AK-56. He was gunned down immediately and the others were shot dead while still inside I The car bore several bullet marks and its windscreen and windows were**

smashed. Blood was splattered all over the seats, with one pistol lying on the back seat while another was near the driver's seat | The cops escaped unscathed with only some bullet marks on the Gypsy to bear testimony of this encounter. Vanzara said the encounter was based on intelligence inputs regarding the movement of a fidayeen squad | The police said Javed Shaikh, alias Pranesh Pillai, who was among those killed, was from Pune and had done a recce of Modi's residence and office at least three times. The girl was not identified immediately. | The other two, whose bodies were not claimed, were identified by Vanzara as Jishan Johar alias Jan-baaz alias Abdul Ghani from Gujranwala district and Amjadali Ak-barali Rana alias Salim from Haveli Diwan. Both, he had claimed, were Pakistanis. **TNN Murdered In Cold Blood**

**Ishrat Jahan:** She was a second-year B.Sc. student of Matunga's Gurunanak Khalsa College. The Mumbra resident would take tuitions to support her family after her father died in 2002

**Javed Ghulam Shaikh:** Born Pranesh Kumar Pillai, the Pune resident had converted to Islam to marry a Muslim. Originally from Alappuzha, police alleged he was Ishrat's boyfriend

**Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Akbar Ali Rana and Jisan Johar Abdul Gani:** Little was known about the duo as no one claimed their bodies. But Monday's order established they were Indians, not Pakistanis as the Gujarat cops had claimed

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=TOINEW&BaseHref=TOIM/2009/09/08&PageLabel=1&EntityId=Ar00100&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

## **Guj cops killed Mumbra girl in cold blood, finds probe**

### **'Ishrat Encounter Staged To Curry Favour With Modi'**

**Saeed Khan | TIMES NEWS NETWORK**

Ahmedabad: Ishrat Jahan, the 19-year-old student of Mumbai's Khalsa College, and the three others who were proclaimed Lashkar-e-Taiba operatives on a fidayeen mission to kill chief minister Narendra Modi, were killed one day before they were actually shown as killed in a police encounter.

An inquiry into the encounter of June 15, 2004 by a magisterial court has revealed that the killings of the four who were dubbed LeT operatives did not happen at the time and place the police officially revealed and were staged by then Ahmedabad police commissioner K R Kaushik, crime branch chief P P Pandey and DIG D G Vanzara and his men to flatter chief minister Narendra Modi for "promotions".

The report names 21 cops, including retired DGP Kaushik, as party to the killings of these innocent persons by branding them terrorists.

As in the Sohrabuddin Shaikh fake encounter case, where the couple was abducted and brought to Ahmedabad and the wife Kausarbi killed because she was witness to the murder, the crime branch "kidnapped" Pranesh Pillai alias Javed Shaikh and Ishrat from

Mumbai and kept them in illegal custody, the inquiry report says.

It also says that Vanzara's officers killed Javed and the 'Pakistanis' Jisan Johar and Amjad Ali Rana; finally, Ishrat was killed between 11 pm and 12 pm the same night because "she was witness to the killings", the report says.

### **Court seeks Jafri's call records in Gulbarg killings**

A special court has sought the phone call records of ex-Congress MP Ahsan Jafri, a victim of the Gulbarg Society massacre on February 28, 2002. Jafri's family had claimed that he had made frantic calls to top policemen and politicians for help when he was attacked by a mob but to no avail. [P 11 THE ABDUCTION](#) | Ishrat Jahan Raza, a Mumbra resident and second-year BSc student of Khalsa College, and her boyfriend, Pranesh Pillai alias Javed Sheikh, were picked up by the Ahmedabad crime branch from Mumbai on June 12, 2004

**THE FRAME-UP** | On June 15, 2004, police claimed that the duo, along with two 'Pakistani' nationals—Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Rana and Jisan Johar—had been gunned down in an encounter led by IPS officer D G Vanzara. Ishrat and the others, police claimed, were LeT terrorists out to assassinate CM Narendra Modi

**POLICE MOTIVE** | Magistrate S P Tamang found that the four were killed a day earlier; the fake encounter was carried out to win promotions from the CM. All those killed were innocent, the report said. Also, Rana and Johar were Indian nationals, not Pakistanis

**IN THE DOCK** | Then Ahmedabad police chief K R Kaushik, Vanzara, who is now in jail for the Sohrabuddin Shaikh fake encounter, and other top cops **Ishrat was shot point-blank, gun placed in her hand**

Ahmedabad: DIG D G Vanzara had told the media that Ishrat Jahan and three others were killed after a dramatic police chase around 4.30 am on June 15.

The magisterial inquiry, based on scientific evidence that relied on the digestive food remains in the stomach and the state of the four bodies, concludes that all the bodies at the site had rigor mortis showing they were killed several hours earlier.

After the three men were killed, Ishrat was forcibly dragged and positioned in the front seat of the car and shot from close range and a pistol was then placed in her hand. The police then put her college identity card around her neck and her purse was placed in the boot of the car, which was "uncanny". It also declares that Johar and Rana were Indians.

It says the Indica car was either towed or driven to Kotarpur water works at 4.30 am on June 15. The policemen had also dragged Amjad's body to the road divider alongside the car and placed a 9 mm gun in his hand—to show that he had been killed in action.

Metropolitan magistrate S P Tamang, who submitted his report after conducting an inquiry under Section 176 of the CrPC, has concluded that Rana and Johar were actually Indians and innocent.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=TOINew&BaseHref=TOIA/2009/09/08&PageLabel=3&EntityId=Ar00302&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

Gujarat EDN

## Ishrat was gunned down after dramatic chase

Ahmedabad: It was three days before the rath yatra in 2004. There were rumours that the Ahmedabad crime branch was going to do something spectacular. Early morning on June 15, now jailed IPS officer DG Vanzara and his men shot dead four persons, including a 19-year-old student of Guru Nanak Khalsa College of Matunga, Ishrat Jahan, after a dramatic chase, stating that they were dreaded LeT operatives out to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

Among the automatic weapons, ammunition and satellite phones seized, police also said that they found coconuts dipped in the chemical, meant to be used as improvised explosive devices, probably for the rath yatra on June 19 that year.

The story Vanzara gave then was that the encounter which took place around 4.30 am near Kotarpur water works on the city's outskirts after the police chased the terrorists, who were in a blue Indica car. While the crime branch team was in a Gypsy, headed by ACPs Narendra Amin and GL Singhal, chasing the Indica which rammed a divider and a terrorist Akbarali Rana jumped out and fired at the cops from an AK-56 rifle.

He was gunned down immediately and others were shot dead while still inside the car. The car bore several bullet marks and its windscreen and windows were smashed. Blood splattered all over the seats with one pistol lying on the back seat while another was near the drivers seat.

The cops escaped unscathed with only some bullet marks on the Gypsy to bear testimony of this encounter. Vanzara said the encounter was based on intelligence inputs on the movement of a fidayeen squad. The police said Pranesh Pillai alias Javed Shaikh, who was among those killed belonged to Pune and had done a recce of Modi's residence and office, at least three times. The girl was not identified immediately. The other two whose bodies were not claimed, were identified by Vanzara as Jishan Johar alias Janbaaz alias Abdul Ghani from Gujranwala district and Amjadali Akbarali Rana alias Salim from Haveli Diwan. TNN

[http://epaper.indianexpress.com/IE/IEH/2009/09/08/ArticleHtmls/08\\_09\\_2009\\_001\\_014.shtml?Mode=1](http://epaper.indianexpress.com/IE/IEH/2009/09/08/ArticleHtmls/08_09_2009_001_014.shtml?Mode=1)

Cops faked Ishrat killing for rewards: probe report

EXPRESS NEWS SERVICE

AHMEDABAD,

LESS than a month after the Gujarat High Court formed a threemember committee under an Additional Director General of Police to probe the 2004 killing of Ishrat Jahan and three others in an encounter by Gujarat police, a magisterial report into the incident has claimed that the four were gunned down in cold blood, allegedly by police officers eager to get promotions and the appreciation of Chief Minister Narendra Modi.

The 240-page report by metropolitan magistrate S P Tamang was released to the media today by advocate Mukul Sinha who is appearing on behalf of Ishrat's mother Shamima

in the Gujarat High Court. It was on Shamima's petition that Justice Kalpesh Jhaveri on August 13 formed a committee under ADGP Pramod Kumar and sought a report on or before November 30.

Ishrat Jahan, from Mumbra

near Mumbai, was killed in an encounter along with three others in June 2004. The then DCP D G Vanzara, who later became a prime accused in the Sohrabuddin Sheikh fake encounter case, had claimed that all four had links with the Lashkar-e-Toiba and were on a mission to kill Chief Minister Modi.

A month after the encounter, a report published in Lahore-based Ghazwa Times, the Lashkar mouthpiece, had described Ishrat as a "a woman activist of LeT".

The probe into the killings was started by the sub-divisional magistrate of Ahmedabad in 2004 but amendments to the Criminal Procedure Code saw the chief metropolitan magistrate handing it to Tamang since the killings took place in an area under his court's jurisdiction.

Tamang's inquiry report has called the encounter a fake.

Apart from Ishrat, those killed near the Kotarpur waterworks were Javed alias Pranesh Pillai, Amjad Ali Akbar Ali Rana alias Salim alias Chandu alias Rajkumar and Abdul Gani alias Jishant Johar alias Janbaaz s/o Kalu.

The police had claimed the two men with Ishrat and Javed were Pakistanis.

The probe report states that the four were kidnapped from Mumbai on June 12, 2004 and killed on the night of June 14 by the police. Mentioning names of all the officers involved, Tamang said they all conspired to get promotions and appreciation. He said there were no Pakistanis among the four.

According to the report, Javed was killed by the DCB on June 14 between 8.30 pm and 9 pm while the other three were killed the same day between 11 pm and 12 midnight. The report said police officials had either towed or driven the car of the victims to the 'encounter' spot.

Mukul Sinha said they would demand immediate arrest of all police officers named in the report -- then Police Commissioner K R Kaushik, DCB Joint Commissioner of Police P P Pandey, then DCP D G Vanzara, ACP Narendra Amin, ACP G L Singhal and other junior DCB officials.

<http://epaper.dnaindia.com/dnaahmedabad/epapermain.aspx?queryed=5&username=&useremailid=&parenteditioncode=5&eddate=9%2f8%2f2009>

Gujarat EDN

## **ab tak 2... Vanzara's fake encounters**

21 police officials have been named in the Ishrat fake encounter case

has court order in Ishrat case pushed Vanzara into deeper trouble?

Roxy Gagdekar

It seems Roza Ishrat Jahan is a name that is likely to spell imminent doom for tainted cop, DG Vanzara. On Monday, as many as 21 police officials including some serving and some retired IPS officers besides suspended IPS officers like Vanzara, were named in the court's order on the fake Ishrat encounter case. Some retired cops argue that the twist in the tale clearly shows the chaos in the administration, while officers believe that it will clearly spells more troubles for the suspended IPS officer.

Twenty-one police officials, from the level of commissioner of police to even constables of the Ahmedabad crime branch, have been mentioned in the order. Vanzara, who was then deputy commissioner of police, Ahmedabad crime branch, is in the centre of the case and undoubtedly in deeper muck now, after this case was added to his existing list of troubles.

"During the course of investigation, if it is proved that the encounter was a fake one, Vanzara could be prosecuted for cold blooded murder," a retired IPS officer, who didn't want to be named, told DNA. The cop further said that the other officers who have been named in the order can be prosecuted for conspiracy and destroying of evidence as well as for helping in a cold blooded murder.

"It is a matter of investigation by the agency concerned. If any incriminating evidence is found during the course of investigation, legal action can be taken against the culprits," PK Bansal, retired director general of police, told DNA.

Talking to DNA, another retired IPS officer RB Shreekumar said the investigations should not stop till all the people allegedly involved in the encounter, including those whose orders these officers were following, should be brought to book.

However, Pramod Kumar, the chairman of Special Investigating Team probing the encounter case of Ishrat Jahan, said he was not aware of the latest developments and refused to make a comment.

<http://epaper.dnaindia.com/dnaahmedabad/epapermain.aspx?queryed=5&username=&useremailid=&parenteditioncode=5&eddate=9/8/2009>

Gujarat EDN

Guj cops shot Ishrat in cold blood: Magistrate

vanzara is among police officers named in report

Nikunj Soni. Ahmedabad

In another setback to the Gujarat government, a local magistrate has ruled that Ishrat Raza Jahan and three others were killed in cold blood by the Gujarat police on the outskirts of Ahmedabad on June 15, 2004.

The metropolitan magistrate, SP Tamang, conducted an enquiry into the killings under section 176 of the criminal procedure code (CrPC) which lays down that encounters and custodial deaths are entitled to a judicial probe. The magistrate has held that the fake encounter was organised by policemen from the crime branch. The policemen involved had connived with each other and committed the murders to get 'name, fame and promotion and praise' from the chief minister. Soon after the magistrate submitted the report, Mukul Sinha, lawyer of Ishrat and Javed Shaikh's kin in the case, demanded that all police officers who were members of the encounter team be arrested immediately. "A police complaint should be filed against all the policemen and they should be arrested," Sinha said during a media briefing. "The metropolitan magistrate has concluded in his report that the encounter was fake, and that there was no provocation." The crime branch police had made the same claims in the Ishrat Jahan case as they had done in connection with the fake encounter in which Sohrabuddin and his wife, Kausarbi, were murdered. According to the magistrate's report, Javed Shaikh and Ishrat were brought from Mumbai on June 12, 2004, by policemen of the crime branch in a blue Indica car. The report, which runs into over 243 pages, says there was no mention of a female terrorist in the tip-off the police had received. Yet the police had detained her along with Javed Shaikh in the afternoon of June 12, 2004. The report further says that if Ishrat had not been killed, she could have revealed the police conspiracy.

<http://epaper.timesofindia.com/Default/Scripting/ArticleWin.asp?From=Archive&Source=Page&Skin=TOINEW&BaseHref=TOIA/2009/09/08&PageLabel=1&EntityId=Ar00100&ViewMode=HTML&GZ=T>

Gujarat EDN

## **Ishrat was killed in fake encounter: Probe report**

### **KR Kaushik & Colleagues Named As Conspirators**

**Saeed Khan | TNN**

Ahmedabad: Ishrat Jahan, the 19-year old student of Khalsa College, Mumbai, and the three others, who were proclaimed Lashkar-e-Taiba operatives on a fidayeen mission to kill Chief Minister Narendra Modi, were killed one day before they were actually shown as killed in a police encounter.

An inquiry into the Ishrat Jahan encounter case of June 15, 2004 by a city magisterial court has exposed that the killings of four persons who were branded as LeT operatives

did not happen at the time and place the police officially revealed and were staged by the then Ahmedabad police commissioner KR Kaushik, crime branch chief PP Pandey, DIG DG Vanzara and his men to flatter Modi for “promotions”.

The report names 21 cops, including retired DGP Kaushik, as party to the killings of these innocent persons by branding them terrorists.

Just like the Sohrabuddin Shaikh fake encounter case, where the couple was abducted and brought to Ahmedabad and his wife Kauserbi killed because she was witness to the murder, the crime branch “kidnapped” Pranesh Pillai alias Javed Shaikh and Ishrat from Mumbai and kept them in illegal custody, the inquiry report says. It also says IPS officer DG Vanzara’s men killed Javed between 8.30 pm and 9 pm on June 14, then killed the ‘Pakistanis’ Jisan Johar and Amjad Ali Rana, and finally Ishrat was killed between 11 pm and 12 midnight because “she was witness to the killings”, the report says.

Vanzara told the media next morning that they were killed after a dramatic police chase around 4.30 am on June 15.

The inquiry, based on scientific evidence, concludes that from the digestive food remains in the stomach revealed that they were killed several hours before.

After the three men were killed, Ishrat was forcibly dragged and positioned in the front seat of the car and shot from close range and a pistol was then placed in her hand. The police then put her college identity card around her neck and her purse was put in the boot of the car, which was “uncanny”. The reports also declares that Johar and Rana were Indians.

It says the Indica car was either towed or driven to Kotarpur water works at 4.30 am on June 15. The policemen had also dragged Amjad’s body to the road divider alongside the car and placed a 9 mm gun in his hand — to show that Amjad was killed in action.

Metropolitan magistrate SP Tamang, who submitted this report after conducting an inquiry under Section 176 of the CrPC, has concluded that Rana and Johar were actually Indians and innocent.

### **Court seeks Jafri’s call records in Gulbarg killings**

A special court has sought the phone call records of Congress ex-MP Ahsan Jafri, a victim of the Gulbarg Society massacre on February 28, 2002. Jafri’s family had claimed that he had made frantic calls to top policemen and politicians for help when he was attacked by a mob but to no avail. [P 3](#) **THE ABDUCTION** | Ishrat Jahan Raza, a Mumbai resident and secondyear BSc student of Khalsa College, and her boyfriend, Pranesh Pillai alias Javed Shaikh, were picked up by the Ahmedabad crime branch from Mumbai on June 12, 2004

**THE FRAME-UP** | On June 15, 2004, police claimed that the duo, along with two ‘Pakistani’ nationals—Amjad Ali alias Rajkumar Rana and Jisan Johar—had been gunned down in an encounter led by IPS officer DG Vanzara. Ishrat and the others, police claimed, were LeT terrorists out to assassinate CM Narendra Modi

**POLICE MOTIVE** | Magistrate SP Tamang ruled that the encounter was fake and carried out in order to win promotions and the CM’s appreciation. All the four killed were innocent, the report said. Also, Rana and Johar were Indian nationals, not Pakistanis **IN THE DOCK** | Then Ahmedabad police chief K R Kaushik, Vanzara, who is now in jail for the Sohrabuddin Shaikh fake encounter, and other top cops **Cops in soup as skeletons tumble out in Ishrat case** **TIMES NEWS NETWORK**

Ahmedabad: Metropolitan magistrate SP Tamang has held 21 police officials, including

retired director general of police KR Kaushik, who was police commissioner at that time, responsible for the ‘cold blooded’ killing of four persons, including Mumbra girl Ishrat Jahan.

Two IPS officers — DG Vanzara and NK Amin — now infamous for their role in the killing of Sohrabuddin Shaikh were also involved in this encounter where police had claimed that the group were LeT operatives on a mission to kill Modi.

Tamang noted in his report that these officials had staged the encounter to get promotions and praise from the chief minister. Cops conspired murder of the four — Pranesh Pillai alias Javed Shaikh, Amjad Ali Rana and Jishan Johar, apart from Ishrat.

The inquiry report submitted to chief metropolitan magistrate on Monday, state that the cops ‘killed them in cold blood’. The very FIR filed by PI JG Parmar has proved fatal for crime branch officials, as Parmar had described roles of each policemen in this encounter, as if they would get rewards. Other cops named in the report are then joint commissioner of police PP Pandey who was head of the crime branch, DCP DG Vanzara, ACPs GL Singhal and NK Amin.

#### **DATE WITH**

**DEATH June 12, 2004** | Ahmedabad crime branch picks Ishrat Jahan Reza and Javed Shaikh from Mumbai

**June 15, 2004** | The two along with Jisan Johar and Amjadali Rana are killed in an encounter near Kotarpur waterworks **2004** | Metropolitan magistrate initiates judicial inquiry

**2004** | Magisterial inquiry by Ahmedabad district collectorate

**August 2004** | Ishrat's mother Shamima Kausar files a petition in Gujarat High Court demanding thorough probe

**2007** | Shamima changes lawyer in the high court after IPS officer DG Vanzara is arrested in Sohrabuddin Shaikh encounter case

**2008** | Shamima files an application in high court to expedite the proceedings

**August 12, 2009** | Justice KS Jhaveri of Gujarat HC orders a three-member committee headed by additional DGP Pramod Kumar to probe the case

**August 12, 2009** | Chief metropolitan magistrate asks magistrate SP Tamang to conduct inquiry and submit report. Magistrate initiates probe next day

**Sept 7, 2009** | Tamang submits report stating the encounter was fake **Crime branch officials held responsible**

**KM Waghela - PI VD Vanar - PI DH Goswami - PI BA Chavda - PI KS Desai - PSI JG Parmar - PI SP Agrawat - PI RI Patel - PSI Tarun Barot - PI Ibrahim Chauhan - constable Mohanbhai Kalasava - head constable Mukesh Natwarlal Vyas - constable Nizamuddin Burhanmiya - constable Anaju Chaudhary - commando Bhalabhai - driver Mohanbhai Nanjibhai - commando**